## A Simulation Model for Understanding the Diffusion of the Pandemic

Pietro Terna (Retired Professor of the University of Torino and Honorary Fellow of the Collegio Carlo Alberto) with the determinant ideas of Gianpiero Pescarmona and the contributions of Alberto Acquadro, Paolo Pescarmona, Giuseppe Russo, and Stefano Terna

pietro.terna@unito.it https://terna.to.it

Slides and project at https://terna.to.it/simul/SIsaR.html

YouTube channel:

https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC310BWUtgee7BQ7qQ3bqNeA

#### The S.I.s.a.R model

Susceptible, Infected, symptomatic, asymptomatic, Recovered

- Making the *invisible*, *visible*
- Analyzing the odds

[using an agent-based model to cope with a complex phenomenon]

### Preliminary note (1/3)

This is a simulation with random events, please do not take it as a sure forecasting machine; it is a *reasoning machine*, a sort of very complex "what if" mental experiment.

The New York Times offers us an analysis on the *The Covid-*19 Riddle: Why Does the Virus Wallop Some Places and Spare Others?

https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/03/world/asia/coronavirusspread-where-why.html (open link).

#### Preliminary note (2/3)

In the web site of the model, we read:

*Nota bene*. In each series of experiments, we will have variability in the results, although internally consistent. The model makes many agents act and interact; from the <u>complexity</u> point of view, each execution produces a "story," with a specific and unique sequence of emerging effects. Real events would behave in the same way if it were possible to repeat them.

#### Preliminary note (3/3)

We can use the model in a comparative way, observing different ranges of results with different initial conditions and parameters.

Finally, to have a reference at an actual situation, the model is related to the Piedmont scale, with 4,350 agents vs. 4.35 millions of inhabitants. We look also to the time series of the total infected people in Piedmont (an Italian region).

#### Piedmont, with a online <u>calendar</u> of the events



#### The S.I.s.a.R model

#### as an agent-based model









# Exploring analysis both as perspective views and as counterfactual ones

- We have houses, nursing homes, hospitals, factories (offices, shops), schools.
- We will explore:
  - as a perspective choice, school in September;
  - as a counterfactual analysis, school in May;
  - as a counterfactual analysis, preserving health of fragile workers.

#### School in September (1/3): Off

		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions nool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asym (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)
	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 8 cases completed in a few days)	33, 29.7, (102,5)	111, 9.2, (89,7)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
	August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	15, <i>166.7</i>	33, 105.2				
	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	14, <i>217.4</i>	27, 172.8				
	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.93, 1.30	0.82, 1.64				
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 8 cases completed in a few days)	48, 98.5 Ismel - Centro	144, <i>50.0</i> Einaudi	0	0.01	0.58	1.26

#### School in September (1/3): Off

Realistic for Piedmont (could contain a light overvaluation of the contagions in		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	ngions nool, ot. pt. n es)	conta out of schoo symp and asymp (mean value	gions l, t. pt. n s)
nursing homes)	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 8 cases completed in a few days) August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases.	33, 29.7, (102,5)	111, 9.2, (89,7)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
	average no. symptomatic at the date	15, 166.7	33, 105.2				
	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	14, 217.4	27, 172.8				
	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.93, 1.30	0.82, 1.64				
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 8 cases completed in a few days)	48, 98.5 Ismel - Centro	144, <i>50.0</i> Einaudi	0	0.01	0.58	1.26

#### School in September (2/3): On

	with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions tool, t. pt. n s)	contag out of schoo sympt and asymp (mear values	gions l, t. pt. n s)
tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 7 cases completed in a few days)	41, 22.9, (99,0)	106, 6.9, (86.7)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	25, 129.6	21, 127.9				
October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	23, 194.7	20, 196.8				
ratios 10.18/8.18	0.92, 1.50	0.95, 1.54				
at the end of the simulation (excluding the 7 cases completed in a few days)	66, <i>101.2</i> Ismel - Centro	127, <i>43.5</i> Einaudi	0.12	0.18	0.64	1.12

7 luglio 2020

#### School in September (2/3): On

			with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions tool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asym (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)
		tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 7 cases completed in a few days)	41, 22.9, (99,0)	106, <i>6.9</i> , (86.7)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
		August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	25, 129.6	21, 127.9				
No Sen :	school	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	23, 194.7	<b>20</b> , <i>196</i> .8				
0.93, 1.30	0.82, 1.64	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.92, 1.50	0.95, 1.54				
	7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 7 cases completed in a few days)	66, <i>101.2</i> Ismel - Centro	127, <i>43.5</i> Einaudi	0.12	0.18	0.64	1.12

#### School in September (3/3): On, doubling classrooms

	with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	vith NHs affected: with NHs not o. events, mean o. symptomatic eople, (duration) symptomatic people (duration)		contagions at school, sympt. and asympt. (mean values)		gions f l, t. pt. n s)
tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 16 cases completed in a few days)	44, 26.1, (101,2)	94, 8.3, (86,3)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	23, 130.1	23, 91.0				
October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	17, 191.2	16, 175.0				
ratios 10.18/8.18	0.74, 1.47	0.70, 1.92				
at the end of the simulation (excluding the 16 cases completed in a few days)	67, 84.8 Ismel - Centro	117, <i>39</i> .7 Einaudi	0.03	0.08	0.39	1.03

7 luglio 2020

#### School in September (3/3): On, doubling classrooms

			with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	ngions nool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asym (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)
		tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 16 cases completed in a few days)	44, 26.1, (101,2)	94, 8.3, (86,3)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
		August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	23, 130.1	23, 91.0				
No Sen	school	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	17, 191.2	16, 175.0				
0.93, 1.30	0.82, 1.64	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.74, 1.47	0.70, 1.92				
	7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 16 cases completed in a few days)	67, 84.8 Ismel - Centro	117, <i>39</i> .7 Einaudi	0.03	0.08	0.39	1.03

#### School in September (3/3): On, doubling classrooms

		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions nool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asymj (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)		
	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 16 cases completed in a few days)	44, <i>26.1</i> , (101,2)	94, <i>8.3</i> , (86,3)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.		
	August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	23, 130.1	23, 91.0						
No Sep school	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	17, 191.2	16, 175.0					No doubl	ing
0.93, 0.82, 1.30 1.64	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.74, 1.47	0.70, 1.92					0.92, <i>1.50</i>	0.95, 1.54
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 16 cases completed in a few days)	67, 84.8 Ismel - Centro	117, <i>39</i> .7 Einaudi	0.03	0.08	0.39	1.03	19	)

#### School in May: On (Sep On)

		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	at school, sympt. , and asympt. (mean values) doc. stu.		contagions out of school, sympt. and asympt. (mean values)	
	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 11 cases completed in a few days)	51, <i>31.5</i> , (106,3)	96, 5.9, (85,5)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.
	August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	13, 140.6	29, 127.2				
	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	12, 192.3	26, 180.8				
	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.92, 1.37	0.90, 1.42				
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 11 cases completed in a few days)	64, 71.9 Ismel - Centro	125, <i>50.0</i> Einaudi	0.06	0.15	0.53	1.04

#### School in May: On (Sep On)

		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions nool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asym (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)		
	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 11 cases completed in a few days)	51, <i>31.5</i> , (106,3)	96, 5.9, (85,5)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.		
	August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	13, 140.6	29, 127.2					Case no	schoo
	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	12, 192.3	26, 180.8					23, 194.7	20, 196.
	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.92, 1.37	0.90, 1.42						
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 11 cases completed in a few days)	64, 71.9 Ismel - Centro	125, <i>50.0</i> Einaudi	0.06	0.15	0.53	1.04	2	1

### School in May: On (Sep On)

		with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	conta at sch symp and asym (mean value	gions nool, t. pt. n s)	conta out of schoo symp and asymj (mean value	gions f l, t. pt. n s)	12 to 2 not me the wis solutio would been to	23 does ean that sest on have o open
	tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 11 cases completed in a few days)	51, <i>31.5</i> , (106,3)	96, 5.9, (85,5)	doc.	stu.	doc.	stu.	the sch to redu epiden	nool ice the nic
	August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	13, <i>140.6</i>	29, 127.2					Case no s	school
	October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	12, 192.3	26, 180.8					23, 194.7	20, 196.8
	ratios 10.18/8.18	0.92, 1.37	0.90, 1.42						
7 luglio 2020	at the end of the simulation (excluding the 11 cases completed in a few days)	64, 71.9 Ismel - Centro	125, <i>50.0</i> Einaudi	0.06	0.15	0.53	1.04	2	2

#### Fragile workers at home (1/2)

	with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)
tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 9 cases completed in a few days)		155, 8.8, (97,0)
August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date		36, <i>93.9</i>
October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date		30, <i>143</i> .8
at the end of the simulation (excluding the 9 cases completed in a few days)	el - Centro Einaudi	191, <i>36</i> .9

#### Fragile workers in working places (2/2)

	with NHs affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	with NHs not affected: no. events, mean no. symptomatic people, (duration)	
tests completed before August 18 <sup>th</sup> (excluding 5 cases completed in a few days)	5, 23.0, 104,8)	127, 12.4, (91.6)	127 concluded against 155
August 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	2, 123.0	61, 124.0	61 open against 36
October 18 <sup>th</sup> : open cases, average no. symptomatic at the date	2, 182.0	47, 181.7	47 open against 30
at the end of the simulation (excluding the 5 cases completed in a few days)	7, 87.6 el - Centro Einaudi	188, 68.0	191, <b>36.9</b>

## More in an <u>article disseminating the results of the model</u> (in Italian)

#### Final technical notes

It is possible to run this model both online at <u>https://terna.to.it/simul/SIsaR.html</u>, or to download it from the same address and use it locally, installing <u>NetLogo</u>, free and open-source shell for agent-based models.

### Thanks

#### Pietro Terna

pietro.terna@unito.it https://terna.to.it

#### Slides and project at <u>https://terna.to.it/simul/SIsaR.html</u> YouTube channel:

https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC31OBWUtgee7BQ7qQ3bqNeA